Response to Dr. Mike Saks’ presentation:
“The Implications of Marginality in the Medical Profession: The Case of Alternative Medicine”

University Club of Phoenix

C. Daschbach, MD, MPH
Director of Academic Affairs
St. Joseph’s Hospital and Medical Center
Phoenix, Arizona
Friday February 22, 2013
1 Marginality in the Professions

The MYTH OF SIMILARITY
AMA …specialty groups…medical staffs
…would add the MYTH of LEADERSHIP

Marginality and Implications
…”interest based politics”
## Oregon Town Halls Exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PREVENTIVE</th>
<th>ACUTE CARE</th>
<th>SPECIALIZED</th>
<th>END OF LIFE CARE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INFANTS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHILDREN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADULTS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELDERLY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Oregon Town Halls Exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Preventive</th>
<th>Acute Care</th>
<th>Specialized</th>
<th>End of Life Care</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infants</strong></td>
<td>![Up Arrow]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children</strong></td>
<td>![Up Arrow]</td>
<td>![Up Arrow]</td>
<td>![Up Arrow]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adults</strong></td>
<td>![Down Arrow]</td>
<td></td>
<td>![Up Arrow]</td>
<td>![Down Arrow]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Elderly</strong></td>
<td>![Down Arrow]</td>
<td></td>
<td>![Down Arrow]</td>
<td>![Down Arrow]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Oregon Town Halls Exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Preventive</th>
<th>Acute Care</th>
<th>Specialized</th>
<th>End of Life Care</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Infants</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>cents</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>cents</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults</td>
<td>cents</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elderly</td>
<td>cents</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Oregon Town Halls Exercise

- Rank all the diseases
- From most important → Abx child ear infections
- To Liver Transplant → for Drinker will not quit

- The went form TOP down…
  - How much money is there to pay
  - Got to no money…drew a dotted line
Oregon Town Halls Exercise

 Rank all the diseases
 From most important → Abx child ear infections
 To Liver Transplant → for Drinker will not quit

 The went form TOP down…
   How much money is there to pay
   Got to no money…drew a dotted line
  - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -
- Bunion ectomy!
2 Implications & Politics of Marginality

MARKING OUT “orthodox” vs. marginal professions by exclusion rather than ‘subordination’ or ‘limitation’ in division of labour

IMPLICATIONS
-- Way knowledge used (referral structures)
-- Quality of entrants in the pecking order
-- Access to Care via Insurance Support

(Turner 1995)

(Saks)
3 Alternative Medicine

Definitions…Alternative vs. Complimentary vs. Integrative
Evidence-Based Medicine

SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE

+  -

+  

-  

CONSENSUS
Evidence-Based Medicine

SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE

CONSENSUS

+ 24%  -

+  -
PLACEBO EFFECT

A “criticism” of Alternative Medicine?

yet how much of orthodox medicine has little or no “evidence” to support therapies or interventions?

“Pseudodoxia”
tonsillectomies
ear tubes for children
bed rest 10 days after MI (bed pan!)
post op atelectasis fever
LAST COMPLICATING THOUGHTS

US Health Care has a kaleidoscopic multitude of moving parts... an uncountable number of stakeholders and is tied into complex local and national economies.

Health Care Reform... one of the most complex multidimensional and disconnected pieces of social legislation in our history...
PPACA Health Care Reform

The Myth of Sisyphus
PPACA Health Care Reform

- The Myth of Prometheus
LAST COMPLICATING THOUGHTS

But the Professional Marginalization of Alternative Healthcare is an example of how we let professions act in their own best interest...rather than the purpose in our oaths, mission statements and platitudes...
Thank You

Dr. Mike Saks
Dr. Emilia Martinez-Brawley
The John F. Roatch Global Lecture Series
Arizona State University